

**WORKFORCE COMMITTEE MEETING
MINUTES, ACTIONS & DECISIONS**


Date:	Wednesday 28 November 2018	Time:	11:00-13:00
Venue:	Conference Room, Field House, Bradford Royal Infirmary	Chair:	Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director
Present:	<p>Non-Executive Directors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Selina Ullah, Non-Executive Director (SU) - Mr Jon Prashar, Non-Executive Director (JP) - Ms Pauline Vickers, Non-Executive Director (PV) <p>Executive Directors:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Pat Campbell, Director of Human Resources (PC) - Ms Sally Scales, Deputy Chief Nurse (SS), <i>representing Ms Karen Dawber, Chief Nurse</i> - Professor Alex Brown, Deputy Medical Director (AB), <i>representing Dr Bryan Gill, Chief Medical Officer</i> 		
In Attendance:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ms Lily Hurford, Assistant Director (LH) for item W.11.18.10 - Dr David Robinson, Director of Education (DR) for item W.11.18.11 - Ms Tanya Claridge, Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs (TC) - Ms Jacqui Maurice, Head of Corporate Governance (JM) - Mrs Samantha King, Executive Assistant (SK) – Minute Taker 		

No.	Agenda Item	Action
W.11.18.1	Apologies for Absence	
	Dr Bryan Gill, Chief Medical Officer (BG) Ms Karen Dawber, Chief Nurse (KD)	
W.11.18.2	Declarations of Interest	
	There were no interests declared.	
W.11.18.3	Unconfirmed Minutes of the meeting held on 26 September 2018	
	The minutes were accepted as an accurate record.	
W.11.18.4	Matters Arising	
	<p>The committee noted that the following actions were confirmed as closed.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. W.5.18.9: Annual Staff Survey Action Plan – Item on agenda. 2. W.3.18.4: Matters arising: 'Harassment and Bullying' dashboard indicator - Included in dashboard. 3. W.9.18.6: Workforce Committee Dashboard: Exception report on sickness rates – Item on agenda. 4. W.9.18.9: Workforce Report: – Flu vaccinations were provided for Directors at the Board Development Session held on 4 October 2018. 5. W.9.18.19: Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors: Chairs Highlight Report – Workforce Roles escalated to the Board and will be discussed at the April 2019 Board development day. 6. W.9.18.19: Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors: Chairs Highlight 	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>Report. The Director of Strategy and Integration provided an update to the Closed Board on 8 November 2018 regarding BREXIT. PC advised that a communication has been received on the pilot settlement scheme for Health and Social Care Workers from NHS Employers. The scheme is open from 29 November 2018 to the end of March 2019. It is however unclear what happens from the 1 April 2019. PC asked the Committee to note there is a general risk around BREXIT on the Trust's Strategic Risk Register. The risk will be kept under review.</p>	
W.11.18.4.1	Matters Arising from Board of Directors	
	<p>SU referred to the two actions arising from the Board of Directors as detailed in the paper.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Committee noted that the action related to the development of middle managers will be incorporated within the workforce report for March 2019. - With regard to 'Model Hospital' the Committee noted a 'Next Steps' sessions will take place at the Board Development day on 13 December 2018 and on the Board meeting day on 10 January 2019. Following detailed discussion, the Committee noted that validity checks were required to ensure the information on the Model Hospital site was correct. Discussions were taking place at the Trust to determine how to utilise the data in consistent way by managers across the Trust. SU requested that PC review the Model Hospital data on workforce at the Education & Workforce Sub Committee and provide a report back to the Workforce Committee on any potential benefits. 	Director of HR
W.11.18.4.2	Matters escalated from Sub Committees	
	There were no matters to escalate from the sub-committees.	
W.11.18.5	Corporate Risks relevant to the Committee	
	<p>The Committee noted that two risks were the responsibility of the Chief Operating Officer and both these were covered in the workforce report. Following discussion the Committee noted the updates with regard to the following risks.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Microbiology: There is no immediate solution and this is a West Yorkshire wide workforce system issue. The mitigations include use of agency staff where required and continued monitoring of the situation. - Manual handling: this risk is under review with the Health and Safety Committee. <p>PC advised that at the IGRC held the previous week a risk was escalated with regard to the impact of gaps on the Paediatrics Middle Grade Rota. The IGRC agreed to include an overarching Medical Staffing Risk on the register which would be adjusted dependant on the Specialty.</p> <p>SU referred to the restructure taking place within a number of areas and raised her concern with regard to the potential impact on sickness and retention levels on middle managers, which may then impact on performance. PC advised that there are plans to consider this as part of the development piece that is underway on the workforce.</p>	
W.11.18.6	Workforce Committee Dashboard	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>The Committee discussed the items in detail. The following key points were noted.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u>Appraisal Rates</u>: The current appraisal rate was 90%. - <u>Equality Indicators</u>: These would be discussed further under item W.11.18.9 - <u>Sickness Levels</u>: PC referred to the Exception Report at agenda item W.11.18.7. The Trust was now in the third year of trying to reduce sickness absence. The lowest rolling absence rate was 4.3% however the Trust was unable to sustain this. The report details the key interventions aligned to the targets. Actions are in place and the Trust is now focussed on improving the Health and Well-being of the workforce. The newly established Health and Well-being Group is working on the framework toolkit and interventions around the 7 key parts of the framework. HR and Occupational Health are working more closely together on absence hotspot areas. PC further advised that the Trust has been successful in appointing a Special Physiotherapist to the Occupational Health Department, which follows on from the appointment last year of the Occupational Therapist. The workforce also has access to a Vocational Consultant from 'Access to Work' an organisation which offers help and support with regard to Mental Health Services. It was agreed that sickness targets would be reviewed; taking account of the run rates from the previous 12 months as well as considering the positions at other Trusts. - <u>Nurse staffing</u>: Remains relatively stable with fill rates slightly down for days and nights at BRI and slightly up for nights at SLH. The Committee was asked to note that newly qualified Nurses and Midwives that started in October do not appear in the figures presented. Trends and themes are being reviewed and it has been noted that less incidents have been reported through Datix. There were no occasions of less than 2 registered nurses per shift. <p><u>Staff in Post</u>: Staffing numbers have increased.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u>Agency usage</u>: Staffing numbers have decreased. - <u>Staff Turnover</u>: Turnover continues to decrease. - <u>Front-line Staff Flu Vaccinations</u>: The Committee noted that a new indicator has been created. The current figure indicates a take-up rate of 57% which is 5% higher than the same period in the previous year. <p>PC referred to the addition within the report of two new indicators covering the 'Staff Advocacy Service' and 'Harassment and Bullying'. PC asked the Committee to confirm if the information presented was satisfactory. The committee noted that 28 contacts had been made to the advocacy service during the reporting period of which 23 related to harassment and bullying. Following discussion the Committee agreed that the information provided was appropriate and that information on trends should be provided on a six monthly basis due to the small numbers involved. JP commented that the information provided a good starting baseline. PC advised that with regard to</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	the strategic objective to be in the top 20% of employers, triangulation would take place with the staff survey data.	
W.11.18.7	Exception Report: Sickness Rates	
	The Committee noted that this item had been discussed under the previous item W.11.18.6.	
W.11.18.8	Workforce Report	
	<p>PC asked the Committee to note that the majority of items detailed in the report had been covered under agenda item W.11.18.6. The Committee focussed on the following items from the report:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - <u>Nurse Recruitment Update</u>: There is an improvement in the nurse vacancy rates compared to the same period in the previous year. Overall the Trust is in a better position. - <u>Consultant Recruitment</u>: The areas of pressure highlighted within the report include Dermatology and Medical Oncology. Dermatology Services across West Yorkshire remain under pressure. With regard to Medical Oncology the Trust has been out to advert a number of times but has been unable to recruit. The Committee noted that the Cancer Alliance is reviewing provision across West Yorkshire and that the position has affected the performance at BTHFT with regard to meeting the Cancer standards. - <u>Apprenticeships</u>: The Trust is behind trajectory. One of the key reasons is the approach to training Health Care Assistants who are in receipt of the Apprenticeship wage. This has impacted on the retention rate and the Trust is reviewing the position. - <u>Developing Workforce Safeguards</u>: This was a new document published by NHSI concerning requirements with regard to workforce planning, safe staffing and new requirements that the Board should be sighted on. PC asked the Committee to note the summary provided in the paper of the key items that would be considered with regard to the workforce plan for 2019/20. PC agreed to circulate the NHSI document to the Committee. <p>The report was noted and received by the Committee.</p>	Director of HR
W.11.18.9	Equality Update: November 2018	
	<p>PC advised that the six-monthly update covered the key changes and actions since the previous report. The Committee discussed in detail:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The outcomes from the 2017 Staff Survey which identified that disabled staff and those with long term health conditions, along with LGBT staff, reported the worst experiences of working in the Trust. In response the Trust undertook two local online surveys during August and September 2018. The survey for staff with long term health conditions or disability pointed to a number of actions that the Trust should take to improve their experience of working for the Trust. Section 3 of the report provided an update on the actions agreed. PC asked the Committee to note that to inform the action planning she had met with JP and the Head of Equality and Diversity. The Committee noted that due to the low numbers of LGBT respondents and the fact that responses did not reflect the 	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>concerns raised via the national survey, there are no specific actions to take forward.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Overall in terms of the BAME equality targets there are positive results. In support of the Closing the Gap action plan 18 volunteers have agreed to sit on panels for posts banded 8a and above. Two training sessions in support of the volunteers' involvement have been delivered by the Head of Equality and Diversity. PC advised that members of the BAME staff network had highlighted that the work the Trust is undertaking on Equality is not widely understood across the Trust and suggested that an Equality Plan be devised to share with staff, patients, visitors and our partners. PC stated that this plan will be produced in consultation with the staff networks and then be presented to the Board. <p>SU commented that this was a positive report which showed that the Trust was making progress across a number of areas. SU added that the Committee would look forward to seeing the impact of the actions presented. PC advised that with regard to the staff survey results any impacts would probably be seen in 2019 at the earliest however the Trust would conduct local surveys to test the outcomes of the actions. JP stated that given the Council of Governors previous concerns with regard to the trajectories in relation to the Workforce Race Equality Standard he was satisfied with the report and the actions in place.</p> <p>The report was noted and received by the Committee.</p>	
W.11.18.10	Annual Staff Survey Action Plan focussing on Staff Engagement	
	<p>SU welcomed Lily Hurford (LH), Assistant Director of HR to the meeting.</p> <div data-bbox="347 1205 414 1272" data-label="Image">  </div> <p>W.11.18.10 - Increasing engagemene</p> <p>The Committee received and discussed the comprehensive presentation and noted the actions in place. PC confirmed that the employee monthly awards were under review.</p> <p>SU thanked LH for the presentation. LH left the meeting.</p>	
W.11.18.11	Quality Assurance of Postgraduate Medical Education – CMG National Training Survey 2018	
	<p>SU welcomed David Robinson, Director of Education to the meeting.</p> <p>DR provided a detailed overview of the comprehensive paper. Following discussion AB asked the Committee to note that the Acute Workforce paper would be presented to a future meeting of the Executive Management Team adding that from 2019 there would be compulsory changes in the Medical Workforce for core medical trainees. DR confirmed that there were no surprises regarding the outcomes of the survey and the Trust is in the process of confirming the Five-Year Plan.</p> <p>SU thanked DR for his report. DR left the meeting.</p>	
W.11.18.12	Nurse Establishment Review	
	SU advised the Committee that the Nurse Establishment Review would be	Chief Nurse

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	deferred to the meeting scheduled for 30 January 2019.	
W.11.18.13	Nurse Staffing Data Publication Report September 2018 and October 2018	
	<p>SS requested that both reports to be taken as read as the key areas were covered under item W.11.18.6.</p> <p>The Committee noted the reports.</p>	
W.11.18.14	Workforce Committee Annual Report 2017/18	
	<p>The Committee noted that the report covered the period from November 2017 to the present and included the standard items and exceptions which the Committee had reviewed during that period. It was noted that not all members of the Committee had been able to review the report due to an issue with its upload to Board Pad. SU requested that the Committee members should provide comments and confirm their approval of the report with JM by the close of 30 November 2018. The Committee agreed that where no changes were required, the report would be presented to the Board of Directors in January 2019.</p>	Committee Members / Head of Corporate Governance
W.11.18.15	Terms of Reference Review	
	<p>TC advised that the Terms of Reference of all Board Committees have been reviewed in light of the full review recently undertaken of the Board and its Committees. The Terms of Reference for the Workforce Committee were presented for review and approval. The Committee noted the following key changes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The provision of clarity with regard to the Committees' relationships with the Board and the Audit and Assurance Committee. - The requirement to produce an exception report to the Audit and Assurance from each Committee confirming that the Committee has delivered on its responsibilities with regard to the BAF. - The principle duties of the Committee now focussed on the strategic objectives and the Committee's operational duties. - Explicit reference to the Chairman and Chief Executive being able to attend any Committee. - Observers being able to attend a Committee at the discretion of the Committee Chair. - The quoracy for the Committee to include either a Non-Executive or Associate Non-Executive. - Clarity with regard to the role of the Associate Non-Executive who could not assume the position of Committee Chair or Committee Deputy Chair. <p>TC asked the Committee to note that it was proposed that the Health and Safety Committee would be a Sub Committee of the Quality Committee however items involving the workforce would be presented to the Workforce Committee by exception.</p> <p>The Committee confirmed that there were no changes required to the draft Terms of Reference. TC asked the Committee to note that these would now be presented to the Audit and Assurance Committee for review on 4 December (along with the Terms of Reference from all other Board Committees). Where any further amendments were requested by the Audit</p>	Director of Governance and

No.	Agenda Item	Action
	<p>and Assurance Committee these would be circulated to the Committee for virtual approval.</p> <p>SU asked the Committee to note that she would meet with PC outside of the meeting to consider the revised work plan in light of the fact that the Committee would be moving to monthly meetings – as a result of the outcomes of the Board/Committee Review.</p>	<p>Corporate Affairs</p> <p>Committee Chair / Director of HR</p>
W.11.18.16	Board Assurance Framework	
	<p>SU stated that Mandatory Training, which appeared as an indicator, was covered in the Workforce Report but not included on the Workforce Dashboard. SS asked the Committee to note that Mandatory Training was included on the Quality Dashboard and was reviewed by the Quality Committee within the context of 'Safety'. PC agreed to add the gap around Mandatory Training to the BAF for the Workforce Committee.</p> <p>SU discussed with the Committee how to use the BAF more proactively. TC suggested that every paper should include identification of a key control, assurance and mitigation of the risk for the Committee to review. TC added that in considering the papers presented the Committee should decide if the mitigations are sufficient to address the risk or, if anything else is required to deliver what is necessary.</p> <p>SU queried if the narratives, scores and risks needed to be reviewed. PC advised that the risks are quite limited over a score of 12 and all risks are reviewed at the Education and Workforce Sub Committee. TC suggested that the Workforce Committee might benefit from receiving an exception report, including any recommendations from the Education and Workforce Sub-Committee. TC agreed to provide support in the production of the report. The Committee agreed that this would be helpful.</p> <p>SU asked the Committee if, in light of the papers discussed the Committee was content with the narrative in the BAF and the scores reflected. The Committee confirmed that it was.</p>	<p>Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs / Director of HR</p>
W.11.18.17	<p>Any Other Business</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - SU stated that with regard to the discussions that had taken place as part of the fuller Board and Committee Assessment it had been noted that there were some improvements that could be made on how the agenda could be organised. SU advised that this would be discussed with PC and reported back to the committee. TC added that a governance handbook was planned as part of the recommendations from the Board and Committee Review which would include suggestions with regard to agenda setting and work planning. - SU reminded the Committee that this was PV's last meeting. She expressed the Committee's thanks to PV for all her past contributions to the Committee 	
W.11.18.18	<p>Matters to share with other committees</p> <p>There were no matters to share.</p>	

No.	Agenda Item	Action
W.11.18.19	Matters to Escalate to the Corporate Risk Register There were no matters to escalate.	
W.11.18.20	Matters to Escalate to the Board of Directors There were no matters to escalate.	
W.11.18.21	Items for Corporate Communications There were no items for Corporate communications.	
W.11.18.22	Date and time of next meeting 30 January 2019 – 11:00-13:00, Conference Room, Field House, Bradford Royal Infirmary.	



Bradford Teaching Hospitals
NHS Foundation Trust

BRADFORD TEACHING HOSPITALS NHS FOUNDATION TRUST
ACTIONS FROM WORKFORCE COMMITTEE – 28th November 2018

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
26.07.18	W.7.18.12	Recruitment and Retention action plan SU added that, with regard to the report it would be useful to receive an update at a future committee with the evidence column completed and the addition of an impact column. She added that the Committee should then review the rag rating again.	Chief Nurse	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	
26.09.18	W.9.18.7	Workforce Committee Terms of Reference JM to add item to November agenda.	Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	The Board agreed the outcomes from the Board/Committee review on 8 November. All Committee terms of reference, along with their workplans, will be presented to Committees for their review in December 2018 prior to approval by the Board of Directors in January 2019. As there is no Workforce Committee in December; the terms of reference (along with the work plan) will be circulated by email for review by the Committee with the outcomes reported to Board in January. Outcome to be confirmed with Committee in January 2019. Terms of Reference approved by Board of Directors. Finalised Terms of Reference included on the agenda. <u>Action concluded.</u>
28.11.18	W.11.18.8	Workforce Report: Developing Workforce Safeguards: PC agreed to circulate the NHSI document to the Committee.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	Document circulated. <u>Action Concluded</u>



Bradford Teaching Hospitals
NHS Foundation Trust

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
28.11.18	W.11.18.14	Workforce Committee Annual Report 2017/18 SU requested that the Committee members should provide comments and confirm their approval of the report with JM by the close of 30 November 2018. The Committee agreed that where no changes were required, the report would be presented to the Board of Directors in January 2019.	Committee Members / Head of Corporate Governance	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	Report circulated 28 November. NED responses received by 30 November. Annual Report approved. Added to the agenda for Board on 10 January 2019. <u>Action Concluded</u>
28.11.18	W.11.18.15	Terms of Reference Review TC asked the Committee to note that these would now be presented to the Audit and Assurance Committee for review on 4 December (along with the Terms of Reference from all other Board Committees). Where any further amendments were requested by the Audit and Assurance Committee these would be circulated to the Committee for virtual approval.	Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	
28.11.18	W.11.18.15	Terms of Reference Review: Committee Work plan SU asked the Committee to note that she would meet with PC outside of the meeting to consider the revised work plan in light of the fact that the Committee would be moving to monthly meetings – as a result of the outcomes of the Board/Committee Review.	Committee Chair / Director of HR	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	Meeting between SU and PC took place on Friday 7 December 2018 and was attended by TC and JM
28.11.18	W.11.18.16	Board Assurance Framework: Mandatory Training PC agreed to add the gap around Mandatory Training to the Dashboard for the Workforce Committee.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	
28.11.18	W.11.18.16	Board Assurance Framework: Sub-Committee Exception Reporting TC suggested that the Workforce Committee might benefit from receiving an exception report, including any recommendations from the Education and Workforce Sub-Committee. TC agreed to provide support in the production of the report. The Committee agreed that this would be	Director of Governance and Corporate Affairs / Director of HR	Workforce Committee 30 January 2019	<u>Action Concluded</u>



Bradford Teaching Hospitals
NHS Foundation Trust

Date of Meeting	Agenda Item	Required Action	Lead	Timescale	Comments/Progress
		helpful.			
28.11.18	W.11.18.4.1	Matters Arising from Board of Directors: Model Hospital SU requested that PC review the Model Hospital data on workforce at the Education & Workforce Sub Committee and provide a report back to the Workforce Committee on any potential benefits	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 27 March 2019	
28.11.18	W.11.18.4.1	Matters Arising from Board of Directors: Integrated Dashboard – Workforce The Workforce Committee to receive an update on the development of middle managers	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 27 March 2019	<u>November 2018.</u> The Committee noted that this information will be incorporated into the Workforce Report for March 2019 - following the Divisional Restructure.
26.09.18	W.9.18.8	Workforce Plan Outcomes PC to provide an update in six months.	Director of HR	Workforce Committee 27 March 2019	Timescale for report back to the committee is provisional as it is dependent on the NHSI timelines which have yet to be confirmed.
26.09.18	W.9.18.8	Workforce Roles Presentation SU agreed to recommend to the Board a session to consider the development of our future workforce, including the new roles that may be required, to support the delivery of the Foundation Trust's Clinical Strategy.	Committee Chair	Workforce Committee 27 April 2019	Board agreed at meeting held on 8 November that would schedule as part of the Board Development Session scheduled for April 2019.